

Agenda item 9.1
Author(s) / Submitter(s) Secretariat

Definitions of Recommendation and Guideline

1 SUMMARY

This paper describes the present definitions of Recommendation and Guideline, and proposes new definitions.

It seeks advice from the LAP to be provided to the 32nd session of the Policy Advisory Panel.

2 BACKGROUND

2.1 Organisation of Standards, Recommendations, and Guidelines

The relationship between Standard, Recommendation, and Guideline was proposed by PAP to Council in December 2014 and agreed by Council at its 59th session. The paper agreed was C59-8.1.3 Revision 1.

Refer to C62-8.4.2 which is a copy of the revised input paper agreed by C59.

2.2 Purpose and approval method

The purpose and approval method of each of Standard, Recommendation, and Guideline is contained in C62-8.4.2.

Standards are approved by a General Assembly, Recommendations and Guidelines are approved by Council.

3 RECOMMENDATIONS AND GUIDELINES

3.1 Content of a Recommendation and of a Guideline

The content of a Recommendation and of a Guideline was the subject of older guidance in the Secretariat but rigour has been lost in recent years and some Recommendations have become very lengthy and containing much technical detail.

3.2 Definitions, background

December 2014. Document C59-8.1.3 Revision 1 was agreed by Council, and contained the following definitions.

<i>Document</i>	<i>Definition</i>
<i>IALA Standard</i>	IALA Standards form a framework, implementation of which by all coastal states will harmonize marine aids to navigation worldwide. IALA standards cover technology and services and are non-mandatory.

<i>IALA Recommendation</i>	IALA Recommendations describe how to plan, design, operate, and manage marine aids to navigation in order to comply with IALA Standards. Each Recommendation is related to an IALA Standard.
<i>IALA Guideline</i>	IALA Guidelines provide information on aspects of IALA Recommendations, indicating best practices for implementation. Each Guideline is related to an IALA Recommendation.

3.3 Definitions, need for change

In April 2016, an out-of-session PAP discussion reached agreement on the appropriate content of a Recommendation and of a Guideline, but did not discuss definitions.

It was agreed that a Recommendation should be a management level document stating *what* to do, and a Guideline should be a technical document stating *how* to do it.

Committee Chairs are applying this thinking now, but revised definitions and their approval by Council are needed.

June 2016. Document C62-8.4.4 reviewed this matter. Council noted this paper without dissent.

Document C62-8.4.4 states:

“Although definitions were the subject of much discussion at the Policy Advisory Panel in 2014, prior to Council approval in December 2014, the Secretariat, the LAP, and the PAP believe that the definitions of Recommendation and Guideline need revision.

The Secretariat believes that a Recommendation should state “**what**” should be done, and a Guideline should describe “**how**” to do it. This is not what the present definitions state. (Refer Annex A in input paper C62-8.3.1.)

The Secretariat will raise this matter at the next meetings of LAP and PAP, with the objective of a proposal for revision of these two definitions at Council session 63.”

Document C62-8.4.4 goes on to set the scene for new definitions of Recommendation and Guideline, based on the April 2016 out-of-session PAP discussion, by stating the following.

“A simple rule is that a Recommendation should state “what to do” and a Guideline should state “how to do it”.

Recommendation

- A Recommendation is a short document, typically a few pages in length, recommending one or more essential practices
- Each essential practice should be described simply and clearly, in wording appropriate for management level, with minimum or no technical content
- An Annex may be used if supporting technical content is necessary, but it should not contain the recommended essential practice(s), which should be in the body text

This format description should be applied in a flexible manner to take account of the needs of all Recommendations, the variety of technology with which we deal, and the fact of existing (legacy) documents where the format may not be ideal but will suffice for the present time.

Guideline

- A Guideline is a technical document describing how to carry out a specific practice
- A Guideline will generally be linked to a Recommendation, and contain best practice and technical detail, possibly amplified by figures, graphs, equations, and similar
- An Annex may be used if historical information, background, or other supplementary information is required”

These bullet points should form the basis for new definitions of Recommendation and Guideline.

3.4 Definitions, proposed

Recalling the notes above and the input paper to C62, the Secretariat proposes the following definitions, where that of a Standard is unchanged. Square brackets indicate possible additional text, but the Secretariat prefers to omit this in both cases.

IALA Standard (Approved by Council and unchanged)	IALA Standards form a framework, implementation of which by all coastal states will harmonize marine aids to navigation worldwide. IALA standards cover technology and services and are non-mandatory.
IALA Recommendation (New draft)	An IALA Recommendation [is a non-technical document which] specifies what practices shall be carried out in order to comply with that Recommendation, and may be referenced, in full or in part, in an IALA Standard as normative or informative.
IALA Guideline (New draft)	An IALA Guideline [is a technical document which] describes how to implement practices specified in a Recommendation. An annex may be included if background or supplementary information is to be provided.

4 ACTION REQUESTED OF THE LEGAL ADVISORY PANEL

The Secretariat asks the LAP to provide its advice to the PAP at its 32nd session on the two new draft definitions above.