PAP42-6.1.2.2.1

Input paper: [[1]](#footnote-2) VTS51-7.3.1

Input paper for the following Committee(s): check as appropriate Purpose of paper:

**□** ARM **□** ENG **□** PAP **□** Input

**□** ENAV **X** VTS **□** Information

Agenda item [[2]](#footnote-3) 7.3

Technical Domain / Task Number 2 Task 2.1.1…………………………………

Author(s) / Submitter(s) Task Group 1.1.1.2……………………

Comment on Portrayal and Proposals for Next Work Programme

# Summary

This paper reviews the history and development of IALA documentation relating to portrayal and makes proposals to be taken forward in the next work programme.

## Purpose of the document

The purpose of this document is to consider the way forward for the development of IALA guidance on the portrayal of VTS and other information and data, to address the need for the current recommendation R0125 (V-125) to be transposed into a guideline and to make recommendations.

## Related documents

IALA Guideline 1105 - *Shore side portrayal ensuring harmonisation with e-Navigation related information* -Ed.1-rev1 Dec 2013 [1].

# Background

The background to this issue is complex and is becoming increasingly confused due to the uncoordinated involvement of several committees and conflicting tasks, The key points in development of associated guidance and tasks are set out below:

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Date | Document/Event | Comment |
| Jun 2003 | Recommendation V-125 - Use and Presentation of Symbology at a VTS Centre [2] | This document was developed under the lead of WG1. It was intentionally limited to the display of the VTS traffic image to address the question posed at the time of whether a VTS display should be aligned to IMO on-board standards. The key principle set out was that the international on-board symbology and chart standards should be used as far as possible but that adaptions were permitted within the guidance provided to ensure that maximum advantage could be taken of technical developments. |
| March 2013 | Workshop – VTS Portrayal | Comprehensive conclusions set out in the report of the workshop [3]. Conclusion “Portrayal Issues no. 14” appears to be the genesis of Task 2.1.1. |
| December 2013 | Guideline 1105 - Shore side portrayal ensuring harmonisation with e-Navigation related information [4} | Guideline 1105 drafted by e-Nav Committee and submitted to Council under cover of paper C56-9.4.1-1 [5] and approved by Council at C56 Dec 13 [6] |
| June 2020 | C71-11.2.2 - Revocation of Guideline 1072 [7] | ARM Committee concluded that guidelines 1072 and 1105 are point-in-time documents that have been overtaken by events and recommends to Council the revocation of Guideline 1072 and significant revisions to Guideline 1105, to be coordinated with the VTS Committee.  In approving the revocation of Guideline 1072 [8], Council noted that updating Guideline 1105 could cover Guideline 1072, and this task would be coordinated with the VTS Committee. |
| Feb 2021 | VTS50 Input paper - Update to IALA VTS Documentation on Adoption of Revised IMO Resolution on Vessel Traffic Services [9] | Input paper recommends inter alia that the VTS Committee “*Consider the amalgamation of Recommendation V-125 on The Use and Presentation of Symbology at a VTS Centre with Guideline 1105 – Shore-Side Portrayal Ensuring Harmonisation with E-Navigation Related Information”* (assumed as part of Task 2.1.1). |
| March 2021 | VTS Committee Task Register for 2018-2022 [10] | Under Task 2.1.1 - Develop Guideline on the Portrayal of VTS Information and Data (both operational and technical aspects) (with WG1), the task quotes from VTS46 report: “*Progress made in VTS45 was put on hold, due to the emergence of an existing guideline G1105 (Shoreside portrayal ensuring harmonisation with ENAV related information) which already covers much of the requirements of Task 2.1.1. Therefore, in order to prevent any duplication of work, a gap analysis was undertaken. The findings will be incorporated into G1105 and G1111 as appropriate during VTS47.”*  The task to draft a guideline is linked to recommendation R1014  Revision notes identify that the task is to “*coordinate with ENAV and ARM on GL 1072 and GL 1105”.* |
| April 2021 | Report of the 50th Session of the IALA Vessel Traffic Services (VTS) Committee [11] | Overall status of the VTS Committee 2018-2022 Work Programme after VTS50 shows under Task 2.1.1: “Develop Guideline on the portrayal of VTS information and data (both operational and technical aspects)” with a note by Council 71 to coordinate with ENAV and ARM on GL1072 and GL1105. |
| June 2021 | Work Programme for Committees 2018-2023 [10] | The latest version of the work programme identifies under Standard 1040 (VTS) Scope 4.3 (VTS data and information management):   1. The recommendation R0125 (V-125) *The use and presentation of symbology at a VTS centre* with no associated guideline 2. The recommendation R1014 *Portrayal of VTS information and data* with a yet to be issued guideline on *The portrayal of VTS information and data* for action by the VTS Committee.   The work programme also identifies under Standard S1060 (Digital Communication Technologies) Scope 6.1 (Harmonised CMDS, Maritime IoT):   1. A new recommendation to be drafted on *Communications channels for [public service] digital information services in coastal areas* with the associated guideline G1105 Shore*-side portrayal ensuring harmonisation with e-Navigation related information* as an ENAV lead in cooperation with ARM and VTS. |

# Discussion

The development history of Task 2.1.1 set out above identifies how confusion has evolved over the current task relating to the development of separate guidelines on general portrayal issues.

Recommendation V-125 *Use and Presentation of Symbology at a VTS Centre* was drafted under the lead of WG1 to address the perceived need to respond to the question posed at the time of whether a VTS display should be aligned to IMO on-board standards. It was approved by Council and issued in 2003. It was intentionally limited to the display of the traffic image and established the key principles that the international on-board symbology and chart standards should be used as far as possible but that adaptions were permitted within the guidance provided. This was to ensure that equipment providers could take maximum advantage of evolving technical developments. The principles set out in this document have withstood the test of time but, following the changes to IALA documentation structure, this document should now be in the form of a guideline rather than a recommendation and, with the development of other IALA guidance, it is apparent that an opportunity exists to combine the principles in V-125 with other IALA guidance. Task Group 1.1.1.2 reviewing IALA documentation for alignment with the new IMO Resolution, identified this possibility and made the recommendation that the VTS Committee should consider the amalgamation of Recommendation V-125 on The Use and Presentation of Symbology at a VTS Centre with Guideline 1105 – Shore-Side Portrayal Ensuring Harmonisation with E-Navigation Related Information noting the content of Guideline 1105 and on the assumption that a review of Guideline 1105 was part of Task 2.1.1.

Guideline 1105 - *Shore side portrayal ensuring harmonisation with e-Navigation related information* was drafted by e-Nav Committee and approved by Council at C56 in December 2013. There is no record of the VTS Committee ever having been consulted on the development of this guideline. The lack of consultation is reflected in the task register for VTS Task 2.1.1 which states “Progress made in VTS45 was put on hold, due to the emergence of an existing guideline G1105 (*Shoreside portrayal ensuring harmonisation with ENAV related information*) which already covers much of the requirements of Task 2.1.1”. The title of this document suggests that it is very much related to the portrayal of e-Navigation related information, whereas the document largely addresses the display of the VTS traffic image. It is, therefore, very surprising that the VTS Committee was not consulted in its development and invited to agree it prior to its submission to Council.

Further confusion was subsequently generated in Jun 2020 when the ARM Committee, in reviewing documents under their lead noted that much of the content of Guideline 1072 – *AtoN Information Exchange & Presentation* could be incorporated in an updated version of Guideline 1105. In approving the revocation of Guideline 1072 Council, at C71, noted that updating Guideline 1105 could cover Guideline 1072, and that ARM should coordinate this task with the VTS Committee.

This confusion was underlined by two further developments. Firstly, the current version of the Committee work programme shows two separate tasks. A VTS Committee Task 2.1.1 to develop a new guideline on *The portrayal of VTS information and data* and a separate task for ENAV to update Guideline 1105 *Shore side portrayal ensuring harmonisation with e-Navigation related information*. However, the document being used for the basis of Task 2.1.1 is Guideline 1105, thus, cross-connecting the two tasks. The second development was that the VTS Manual Edition 7 (Feb 2021) identified Guideline 1105 under section 8 (VTS Data and Information Management) where, from its content, it would logically lie, but this was amended in the June 2021 Edition 8 of the VTS Manual to place this guideline under section 15 (Additional Guidance Related to the provision of VTS) to align it with the Committee Work Programme 2018-2022.

The final piece in this vey convoluted matter is the posting in August 2021 to the IALA Nextcloud fileshare of the latest draft of the new guideline on *The Portrayal of VTS Information and Data,* which drops the Guideline number of Guideline 1105 and adopts a new title but otherwise comprises a significant proportion of the current Guideline 1105. Consideration does not appear to have been given to the incorporation of R1025 (V-125) and it does not appear that WG1 has yet been consulted. The current draft still contains unnecessary detail on shipboard requirements and some of the detailed technical guidance might better reside in Guideline 1111 as recorded in the VTS46 report and which is also scheduled to be updated.

## Conclusions

There appears to be a multi-track approach to work on portrayal within the ENAV, ARM and VTS Committees which lacks coordination and rationalisation. In addition, the opportunity to transpose R0125 (V-125) into a guideline has not been taken. Whilst it is understood that equipment providers are increasingly offering solutions that combine the functions of traffic image display and the presentation of other supporting management information data, IALA should focus on the constituent parts and provided appropriate guidance on the display of the traffic image separately from the presentation of other information and data, leaving it to equipment providers to identify how far these can be appropriately combined for presentation to VTS personnel.

Such an approach would give greater clarity to the task in hand, the one under S1040 and the other under S1060. For VTS, there is a need to go back to first principles to decide what should be provided as general principles under Task 2.1.1 taking greater account of the conclusions of the Portrayal Workshop and what would be better provided as detailed technical guidance as part of the update to Guideline 1111 under ENAV.

# References

1. IALA Guideline 1105 - Shore side portrayal ensuring harmonisation with e-Navigation related information -Ed.1-rev1 Dec 2013
2. Recommendation V-125 - Use and Presentation of Symbology at a VTS Centre
3. VTS37-4.5 Report of the IALA Workshop on the Portrayal of Data and Information at a VTS
4. Guideline 1105 - Shore side portrayal ensuring harmonisation with e-Navigation related information
5. C56-9.4.1.1 Draft Guideline shore side portrayal
6. C56 Final Report of Council 56 Dec 13
7. C71-11.2.2 (ARM11-13.3.2) Revocation of Guideline 1072
8. C71-19.1 Report of Council 71 Jun 20
9. VTS50-9.1.3 IALA Docs Editorial Alignment - Input Paper - final
10. VTS50-7.1.2 VTS Task Register 2018-2022 - Rev2 (2021-03-31)
11. VTS50-14.1 Draft Report of VTS50
12. Committee-Work-Programme-for-2018-2023-Council-73-approved
13. 20210402\_VTS50-10.1.1 WP-G1105\_DRAFT\_Task\_Group\_2.1.1 (VTS49-12.2.2.1)\_updated\_final

# Action requested of the Committee

The VTS Committee is requested to:

1. Consider the need to incorporate Recommendation R0125 (V-125) into Task 2.1.1
2. Consult with ARM whether the aspects of Guideline 1072 recommended for incorporation in G1105 should be part of Task 2.1.1 or part of the work by ENAV under S1060.
3. Consult with ENAV and ARM on which aspects of Guideline 1105 should be retained in an updated version of Guideline 1105 under ENAV lead and which aspects should be passed to VTS for incorporation in Task 2.1.1.
4. Defer task 2.1.1 and the update to G1105 into the next work programme and consider these as two tasks to be continued into the next work programme with consultation between committees as appropriate.

1. Input document number, to be assigned by the Committee Secretary [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
2. Leave open if uncertain [↑](#footnote-ref-3)